

YGT WEBSITE

YGT CONSERVATION AND PLANNING February 2020

The YGT's work on planning matters in Yorkshire is continuous and it's easy at times to become disillusioned as we battle to get finer planning solutions, that deliver change without destroying the qualities that make life enjoyable, happy and hopefully beautiful. So, when I read that on January 30th Robert Jenrick, MP, Secretary of State for Housing Communities and Local Government was at the Garden Museum to launch the report, *Living with Beauty*, the final report from the *Building Better, Building Beautiful Commission*, I was uplifted. Mr Jenrick noted that the Garden Museum is in many respects a fittingly beautiful venue which speaks of the themes in the report; a historic building that has been put to new uses and it champions trees and gardens. So far so good.

If new housing developments are more attractive, the commission argued, they can pass through planning more easily as people who already own homes will be less afraid it will devalue their property. A goal of planting two million trees on streets should be set, said the commission. Developers should also be encouraged to plant a fruit tree in an urban community orchard for every house they build, to improve community well-being. (We'll need lots of volunteers to look after them I thought, but no matter, it's a good idea. Please tell Sheffield CC.)

Developers who demonstrate a "commitment to quality" and a sensitivity to the local context should have their projects green lit sooner as part of a "fast track for beauty". "In this way, developers should be incentivised to deliver, indeed actively promote, beauty through their schemes." Overall, the report places an emphasis on developing brownfield sites and focusing on beauty no matter where building takes place. Renovating a derelict building should incur no VAT, or at minimum, a tax of five per cent. This is potentially great news for our historic buildings. Beauty may be difficult to define in planning terms but it can be done, and as we know, beauty is as much to do with spaces as individual buildings, so I'm hopeful that there will be a place for well-designed green space and streetscapes in the future. I applaud the thinking ... and just hope that I'm still around to see it delivered.

Since mid-July last year working with the Gardens Trust we have responded to fifty-four planning applications; some major but quite a number for minor changes or where there are internal alterations proposed for listed buildings. Here we do not comment as we are a gardens trust and generally do not have the relevant expertise. I mentioned last time that often applications can be minor changes to properties on the boundary of a park or garden but within the 'setting' and present few concerns. However, we are sometimes brought up short with an application that may look innocuous but then when the documents are looked at, it is far from the case. One such example came to our attention recently through our contacts with Historic England (HE). Although **Wentworth Castle** is grade I on the HE Register of Historic Parks and Gardens for some inexplicable reason Barnsley MBC never contacted the Gardens Trust (GT) despite the fact that the GT is the statutory consultee for any proposed development affecting a site on the Register. We are grateful for our good links with HE and have written to the planning authority. The planning application was for the demolition of an existing bungalow immediately within the south west boundary of the park. It is clear from the maps that there had long been a small building close to the site of the bungalow, possibly an animal house and paddock within the historic parkland. It was screened from view by the associated avenue running up to Archer's Hill Gate from the 'Old Cold Baths' opposite Cold Bath Farm. Although the Baths were destroyed during open cast mining after the Second World War, the Farm survives and its central courtyard was the focal point of the Rotunda steps. Therefore, it is clear this was not an insignificant area of the park. The existing bungalow on the site does not make a contribution to the character of the parkland and so we have no objection to its demolition. A new dwelling could be accommodated on the land but the proposal was not sensitively designed to fit comfortably into the surrounding parkland and views, so we objected strongly to this application. We were not the only relevant organisation not to be notified. The National Trust did not know about this planning application until they were contacted by HE and ourselves.

Geoff Hughes who lives in Huddersfield came to the planning training last year and we're delighted that he's become a member of the Conservation and Planning Team. We're very fortunate as we now have members living in a wide area of Yorkshire who with their local knowledge make our responses easier to frame. Geoff's long-term visits to **Bretton Hall and Yorkshire Sculpture Park** with his wife Maddy (YGT trustee) became very helpful in February when we were consulted on an application for Listed Building

Consent for works of restoration, conversion and development to the Mansion House, Stables and Coach House, Camellia House, curtilage and associated buildings within the Bretton Hall Estate.

Bretton Hall is a unique heritage asset combining as it does a number of listed buildings including the mansion; pleasure grounds of the late 18C and early 19C, parkland of the 18C with earlier origins and links with two notable landscape designers/gardeners, Richard Woods (1716-93) and Robert Marnock (1800-99); and the Yorkshire Sculpture Park laid out on part of the pleasure grounds and parkland. The declining state of the historic buildings and surrounding area at the core of the Bretton Hall estate has inevitably given considerable concern, and we are generally supportive of the proposed new use for the grade II* listed mansion (a hotel) and the proposals for the Camellia House and changes to the car parking nearby. However, when we went through the documentation, we had reservations about the impact of some proposals on the wider setting ie the grade II registered parkland, which is significant in its own right. Geoff and Maddy were able to make a site visit and particularly advise me on the trees and changes to other car parking arrangements and access roads. The proposal to site a large marquee on the south terrace we opposed as it will have a major impact on views from the south; from the lake and beyond. As many of you will know Susan Kellerman – along with Karen Lynch - has much experience and historical knowledge about Bretton Hall and so was an invaluable help with this application. Susan's breadth of knowledge in the greater Leeds area and specialist knowledge of other historic designed landscapes often comes into its own with planning!

Before Christmas Chris Mayes, HE's landscape architect contacted me about **Marske Hall in Swaledale** as he had been asked to look at a major planning application for the Hall and associated buildings and garden. In the mid 1990's, during the English Heritage Register Review, a number of historic designed landscapes and gardens in North Yorkshire including Marske Hall were put forward as likely to be suitable for Registration, however they were never taken any further due to lack of resource. This was a golden opportunity for me to do some more research; something for which I never seem to have time, but there was a little window in early January. I had great help from the North Yorkshire County Record Office (NYCRO) which holds the Hutton of Marske archive.

Marske Hall Park and Garden is a multi-layered landscape with its origins likely to be in a medieval deer park. There is indication that there was a house with hall close meadow, orchard, garth and water mill prior to the estates purchase by Sir Timothy Hutton (1569-1629) in 1597. Amongst the papers of Archbishop Matthew Hutton (1524/5-1605/6) and his son Sir Timothy Hutton, there are extensive records relating to the buildings & alterations at Marske Hall 1609-1634 and an agreement for laying out the garden dated June 27 1625. The Hutton family of Marske included two Archbishops of York; Matthew (1524/5-1605/6) and a later Matthew (1692/3-1758) who was Archbishop of York 1747 and Archbishop of Canterbury 1757. The family were famed for horse racing and the breeding of racehorses and John Hutton II (1691-1768) bred a colt, Marske in 1750 who won top races and sired the great and unbeaten racehorse, Eclipse. The Hutton's brought about a series of landscape changes and developments at Marske Hall from the period of the Elizabethan hall, the formal avenue of lime trees on Cat Bank, (almost certainly *Tilia x europaea* 'Pallida', contemporary with the avenues at Castle Howard and a remarkable survival) and into the 18C when the entrance court was removed and the house and stables remodelled or rebuilt (the former c.1730, latter c.1750) and the land modified to form a smooth grass approach with a drive from the east, in something of the English Landscape style typical of gentry estates from mid-century; and later a picturesque landscape around Marske Beck as shown in paintings by George Cuit the elder(1743-1818). The 1718 Buck sketch (Samuel Buck's Yorkshire Sketchbook) and the 1732 survey indicate possible gardens south of the Beck with a small, pitched roof building with ball finial, maybe a gazebo/banqueting house. The Hutton family carried out further interesting work in the mid-19th C

I wrote up the research for HE and this informed both their planning response and ours. Marske Hall is in a beautiful location, but it has been partially empty and left for a number of years, so we support finding a viable future for it. However, we do have concerns about the parking proposal and its impact on the designed landscape as this is a critical part of the setting of the grade II* listed hall and makes an important contribution to the significance of the hall and the assemblage of listed buildings (stables, kennels and sawmill). At HE's request we have put Marske Hall forward to the listing team for consideration for registration. Roger Lambert who joined the Conservation and Planning team earlier last year battled the on-line application for registration using my report, so we await their decision.

Anne Tupholme, a long-standing member of the Conservation and Planning team gives advice for sites in the greater Bradford area and in the southern part of the Yorkshire Dales National Park and Craven. In Craven we responded to two applications for **Gledstone Hall** (listed grade II*), usually recognised as one of Lutyens best classical houses, where he consulted Gertrude Jekyll for the planting plans, (H E Register of Parks and Gardens grade II). One application was retrospective for a summer house in the rear garden of West Lodge. Lutyens' concept for the approach to Gledstone was to produce a balanced design incorporating the hall, forecourt and lodge pavilions. Unfortunately, the roof of the summerhouse protruded above the line of the western edge of the forecourt and was visible when viewed from the front door of the Hall, the forecourt and the approach and affected the balance of the design. Additionally, the roof of the summerhouse was not of a material and coursing which reflected the roofs of the hall and most of the other buildings, so we objected. The applicant lowered the roof which was a good solution and we withdrew our objection. The other retrospective application was for East Lodge for paving and new wall which again we felt totally inappropriate for Lutyens' concept and we objected.

This time last year we had applications for children's play areas but have now moved on to cooking, with two applications for outdoor kitchens. One at **Buckden House** Outdoor Education Centre and the other at **Ingleborough Hall** Outdoor Centre. Whilst we support youngsters learning how to prepare and cook food, we did wonder why they couldn't learn how to do it in the great outdoors instead of under a roof with a fully-functioning kitchen complete with pizza oven. Still, it will be fun and if youngsters can then take the skills into adulthood it will be time and money well-spent. Also, in the Yorkshire Dales National Park, Anne Tupholme and Jane Furse continue to advise at **Parcevall Hall** regarding a replacement glasshouse in the walled garden.

We have had several planning applications for works in public parks. Those for **Roundhay Park**, Leeds CC we felt comfortable about, as we did for an exemplary application from Yorkshire Water for the part demolition of an existing reservoir and construction of another reservoir at **Boston Park**, Rotherham.

Boston Park was the first public park in Rotherham and was laid out in the 1870's over a former sandstone quarry, associated with Boston Castle, (listed grade II), a shooting lodge which occupies a prominent position on an escarpment overlooking the Don and Rother valleys. Recent research indicates that Thomas, third Earl of Effingham and ninth Baron Howard began building 'Boston Castle' on 2nd December 1773 as a shooting box and for much of the first half of 1774 'Boston Castle' is referred to as 'the House upon the Common.' The earliest definitive use of 'Boston Castle' as the permanent name of the building is on a receipt dated 29 July 1774, clearly displaying the Earl's sentiments towards the situation in America - very much opposed to the War. Boston Park is formed of three terraces and includes specimen trees, a formal garden, a sunken garden or 'dell', quarry garden, an arch or doorway (listed grade II) set into the rock face relocated in 1879 from the demolition of the former College of Jesus in Rotherham, a crown bowling green and land for informal recreation. A further significant feature of Boston Park are the fine views. From the Castle and car park panoramic views extend north towards Wentworth Woodhouse and Barnsley (across Moorgate Cemetery), west towards Sheffield and the moors of the Peak District, and south towards north-east Derbyshire. At the request of the Friends of Boston Park who are concerned about the on-going maintenance and condition of the park, we wrote to Rotherham Green Spaces.

In Scarborough, following contact from our friends in Scarborough Civic Society, we were dismayed to find that the Council had radically changed one of only three park shelters in **Peasholm Park** without planning permission. As we also understood that modifications were being made for disabled access at shelters in **South Cliff Gardens**, we contacted Simon Green of Southern Green, landscape architects, and were very pleased to find that Simon had made careful changes for disabled access without radically altering the historic shelter structure.

In October we were contacted by members of the community in Todmorden and the Friends of **Centre Vale Park** who were very dismayed about the condition and future of their **Art Deco bandstand** (1914) in Centre Vale Park. This had been vandalised again and Calderdale Council was considering its demolition. With help from various interested people and organisations, HE assessed the bandstand for special architectural or historic interest and we learned in December that it had been listed at grade II. However, there is still a long way to go to secure the bandstand's future. So, if you have any spare funds then I'm sure the Friends would like to hear from you. Centre Vale Park includes the site of the Fielden family's

Centre Vale Mansion, the coachyard, and the Todmorden War Memorial which is very a special place – and where we gave grant in 2014. The bandstand figures prominently in the layout of the Park.

In Sheffield, along with HE, we removed our objection to plans for the demolition of a warehouse and erection of dwellings near the north west entrance to **Sheffield General Cemetery**, as the dwellings had been reduced in number from 10 to 9 with the plot at the junction of Stalker Lees Road and Cemetery Avenue becoming garden ground. However, we remain anxious about the proposed erection of 11 apartments and 3 duplex apartments in a 4- storey block at the south west boundary of the Cemetery. After more than a year of amended plans, the proposal remains essentially four storeys and will still dominate the cemetery and listed former Cemetery Office. HE also objected. We have recently been sorry to learn that **Kenwood**, now a hotel, but built in the 19C by the cutler George Wolstenholme, who commissioned Robert Marnock to design the garden at Kenwood, and also the layout of the surrounding residential development carried out by Wolstenholme, has had approval for new apartment buildings in parts of the garden.

On a happier note we were very pleased to see the well thought through plans for **Ledston Hall** which is registered grade II* and owned by the Wheler family, descendants of Lady Elizabeth Hastings. The area now called The Grove was originally designed by Charles Bridgeman for Lady Betty Hastings c. 1731. (The payments to Bridgeman by Lady Betty are in C. Hoare and Co., Bankers, London, Ledger K, 27 March 1731.)

Since finding out about the National Trust's pre-application plans for the café building at Canal Gates, **Studley Royal**, we have expressed our concern that further development, will in our view, add to the harm at this location – 'John Aislabie's Vision'. We understand about the visitor pressure, need for more café space, better site interpretation and better lavatories. However, we consider that the proposal for Studley Lodge will have a very damaging effect on this very sensitive area of what is not only a Grade I Historic Park and Garden but also a World Heritage Site (WHS); the only WHS in the UK that has been designated because it is an historic park and garden. The outdoor café area will reach much further towards the pavilions flanking the dam and stepped cascade and the whole built area will be considerably larger. This area represents the point of transition between the wilder character of the deer park and the more manicured gardens/pleasure grounds. The Canal Gates were and are still a main gateway between the park and the pleasure grounds. In relation to this, it is not just the 'Water Gardens' that are important but the site as a whole. We felt that the National Trust has allowed local thinking with a local budget, to undermine the search for long-term strategic development. When we asked the National Trust staff about alternative sites within the WHS we were told that they had absolutely no other options. Currently the National Trust are carrying out a Heritage Impact Assessment with a view to submitting a planning application in April.

In May 2018 we gave advice to the planning authority in Huddersfield about the proposal for a Sikh painted statue to be erected in **Greenhead Park** as a war memorial. We were concerned about the design and painted nature of the proposal and so we are very pleased that a bronze statue to commemorate more than 83,000 Sikhs who were killed and many more wounded during the two World Wars, was unveiled last November.

I would like to record our thanks to a new YGT member, archaeologist, Peter Cardwell who after attending the Bramham Planning Workshop last year has put together a file on Yorkshire's Planning Authorities, Local Plan policies which has been very useful. In addition to members already mentioned, I'm also grateful to Malcolm Barnett, Win Derbyshire, Jane Furse and Peter Goodchild, who give advice, and to David Rhodes, who although not a member of the conservation and planning team, often helps me with Harrogate planning applications. My thanks to Heather Garnett who takes our minutes all the members of the team.

We are much looking forward to our Edwardian Gardens Continuing Professional Development event at **Lotherton Hall** on 17th June. We are delighted to have experts; Mette Eggan, landscape architect from Norway, Dr John Grimshaw, director of the Yorkshire Arboretum, Jane Furse, landscape architect and historic garden specialist and Chris Flynn, Head Gardener, Dyffryn, NT of Wales.

Val Hepworth

Trustee

