

YORKSHIRE GARDENS TRUST

President: The Countess of Harewood Vice-presidents: Lady Legard, Peter Goodchild, Nick Lane Fox www.yorkshiregardenstrust.org.uk

Mr Stuart Daniel Planning Services Leeds City Council Mrs Val Hepworth Trustee Conservation and Planning

planning@leeds.gov.uk department.of.planning@leeds.gov.uk conservation@yorkshiregardenstrust.org.uk

Cc Maria Akers Clare Wallace

7th March 2023

Dear Mr Daniel

22/01355/FU Provision of new recreational facilities to include cycling and walking routes, a 'learn-to-ride' facility, a play area and improvements to wildlife habitats to site of former golf course Temple Newsam Park Temple Newsam Road Halton

We have now revisited the planning application **22/01355/FU** and are responding here to that application as we realise that there are many more documents on the website since our response dated 28th March 2022 and the closing date is today. We do not recall any further consultations apart from Maria Aker's kind e-mail re the proposed Sustrans route (see below). We also refer you to our response of 28th March 2022. As you will know The Gardens Trust is the Statutory Consultee with regard to **any** proposed development affecting a site listed by Historic England (HE) on their Register of Parks and Gardens. In this case Temple Newsam registered grade II. The Yorkshire Gardens Trust (YGT) is a member organisation of the GT and works in partnership with it in respect of the protection and conservation of historic parks and gardens and is authorised by the GT to respond on GT's behalf in respect of such consultations.

We understand and appreciate the provision of new recreational facilities at Temple Newsam, but particularly have reservations about the new cycling and walking routes next this Grade 1 Elizabethan House and have serious concerns that the historic landscape and in particular their impact on its long- standing views have not been properly considered.

When Leeds City Council (LCC) bought the Temple Newsam Estate in 1922, one of its three aims was "to save the historic estate and house from piecemeal destruction or total loss". We feel that this planning application will involve 'destruction' in a piecemeal way, to the fragile western part of the Temple Newsam Estate.

When LCC commissioned and then adopted a Conservation Management Plan (CMP) for Temple Newsam in September of 2022, only 6 months ago, we were impressed by its understanding of the complexity of the site. We anticipated a significant adjustment to the cycling application to show synthesis between the two projects. We conclude that this has not been the case.

For at least 400 years, open grazing land with small parcels of woodland featured on the western side of the house. This is acknowledged in the areas designation as part of the Grade II Landscape by Historic England (HE) and its inclusion in the registered area *despite* having suffered decades of opencast mining in mid- 20th century. As such it still holds statuary protection from inappropriate development.

The current planning documents propose strengthening the late -20th century golf course fairways without any attempt to restore the listed landscape or ameliorate the harm planting new trees along these 1970 lines -with a normal lifespan of 200 years - will cause. This restoration lay at the centre of our discussions when asked to a meeting on site with Glenn Gorner, John Thorpe and Adam Toole on 15th February.

Instead of open grazing land with tree clumps allowing views to and from the core Elizabethan House, the Grade I jewel in LCC's property crown, the proposals show that the entire (historic) Western Parkland it is to be separated off conceptually as well as physically. (refs below relate to the CMP and its pages) *Temple Newsam house is integral to the design, intent and implementation of the parkland as many views were designed to be seen from the house and others would have focused their intention on this historic pile.* p.146).

No views are to be opened up for visitors to and from the house into the western parkland (whether on bicycles or on foot), no protection for the historic Tudor Mount from bike riders is mentioned or detailed and no clearance of the 1970's bund with its "inappropriate tree planting" (Policy 17), which runs right across the historic western vista is proposed for amelioration.

As a result, we cannot support these proposals for the Temple Newsam Estate and consider that the harm caused to the Western Parkland by the planting of trees along 1970s golf fairways does not provide sufficient benefit to the historic gardens and landscape to be justified. Indeed, the longevity of the proposals, the normal 200 year old lifespan of native/ornamental trees pushes these proposals into "Substantial Harm" which LCC's brand new CMP states "will not be allowed"

The Gardens Trust, in association with the Yorkshire Gardens Trust believe that this planning application, submitted incrementally over the past twelve months, does not take account of the CMP OR follow its guidelines and as a result we consider that it should be refused, and a more sympathetic proposal should be developed.

Appendix 1 extracts from the CMP adopted by LCC in September 2022 relevant to this current planning application and any further consultations with interested parties.

Aim 3 "to save the historic estate and house from piecemeal destruction or total loss".

Principles 4 "LCC should assess the impact of any proposed change"

:- 6 "Great weight will be given to Conservation"

Page 9 states that

"Landscape Management of the woodland and parkland will focus on balancing amenity uses with historic features such as key views 'which are fragile to change' ".

Summary of Significance p.9

Key themes at Temple Newsam include

"Nationally significant examples of landscape design"

"Views across the landscape and connections to historic routes"

P.131

Considerable Importance

7) 'Relationship between terrace, south gardens, Tudor Mound and listed features are important'

19&20) South garden area and Mound,

'thought to be the remains of a formal garden feature within the Tudor Garden dating perhaps to the Darnley or Lennox families'

- Mound has High Archaeological potential for public interpretation.

P. 146 Views

Temple Newsam house is integral to the design, intent and implementation of the parkland as many views were designed to be seen from the house and others would have focused their intention on this historic pile.

The CMP concludes that

Unification of Strategic Direction is a **key** aspect of this as the disparate Council Departments find it challenging to provide an holistic oversight of the whole estate.

We also wish to record our thanks to Maria Akers, Senior Estates Manager for her e-mail of 23rd February regarding the Temple Newsam Active Travel Corridor (cc to Clare Wallace) where she writes that:

'Sustrans are once again looking at trying to create a logical link from the bridlepath that ends close to end of the south garden at Temple Newsam with the end of Elm Walk and with the routes that lead to the west alongside Temple Newsam Road.

The route is intended not only to formalise the existing commuter route that is well used but to make a better connection between the heritage assets of Temple Newsam and the new community that will exist directly on the other side of the motorway (accessed through the underpass) and across the river through to Rothwell.

We have been trying to resolve this route for a number of years but there have always been issues as it falls so close to Temple Newsam House/Gardens. We looked two potential routes with the Sustrans team on Monday and CJ has shown those potentials in the sketch below (not provided here). I've shared the sketch with colleagues in Leeds Museums and Galleries and will be discussing later this afternoon.

Each route has advantages/disadvantages and the team are keen to consult with you both.

The orange route removes conflict between cyclists and pedestrians on the north east corner of the north wing of the house but potentially impacts on the garden mounds, the historical importance of which isn't fully investigated and simply may not be used as is it is not direct.

The green route has the potential to link to the road in front of TN house that just ends by creating a track on the old alignment of the carriage road. The issue with this route is that the north east corner is one of the busiest points of the whole site being the main pedestrian circulation between the house, car park and courtyard. There was discussion on site that it may be possible to slightly realign the pedestrian path to create a better site line – which did look feasible.'

Prior to Maria's e-mail of 23rd February, on the 15th February, Jane Furse and I were pleased to visit Temple Newsam to discuss proposed tree planting in the western part of the registered historic park with Glenn Gorner, Natural Environment Manager, and his colleagues along with Adam Toole, Curator Temple Newsam & Decorative Art. Our discussions focused on how to loosen up the existing tree planting that was put in c.1970 to create the golf fairways, integrate new planting and open up views both from and to the House (in particular that towards Leeds), return to the correct parkland aesthetic, and whilst planting trees and shrubs that were favoured by 'Capability' Brown, to consider the problems of climate change. We thought that the tree planting would be a great opportunity to relate the House back to its 400 year old western setting and to renew the historically based design for the 21st century.

We are also cc this response to Adam Toole and Glenn Gorner for information.

Yours sincerely

Val Hepworth
Trustee Conservation and Planning

cc. Historic England, e-yorks@historicengland.org.uk; Conservation@ the Gardens Trust