



YORKSHIRE GARDENS TRUST

President: The Countess of Harewood

Vice-presidents: Lady Legard, Peter Goodchild, Nick Lane Fox

www.yorkshiregardenstrust.org.uk

Ms Rachael Roddis
Planning Officer
Barnsley Metropolitan Borough Council

Mrs Val Hepworth
Trustee
Conservation and Planning

conservation@yorkshiregardenstrust.org.uk

developmentmanagement@barnsley.gov.uk

17th October 2023

Dear Ms Roddis

2023/0783 Erection of single storey rear extension to rear of bungalow cottage, excavation works to rear to create new levelled out rear garden with paving surface and replacement retaining walls and fences around the perimeter. Chimney Cottage, The Avenue, Wortley, Sheffield, S35 7DB

Thank you for consulting The Gardens Trust (GT) in its role as Statutory Consultee with regard to proposed development affecting Wortley Hall, a site included by Historic England (HE) on their Register of Parks & Gardens, as per the above application, at grade II. The Yorkshire Gardens Trust (YGT) is a member organisation of the GT and works in partnership with it in respect of the protection and conservation of registered sites and is authorised by the GT to respond on GT's behalf in respect of such consultations.

Wortley Hall has been associated with the Wortley family since the time of King Stephen and significant architects and landscape designers have worked there from Ralph Tunncliffe in the 1730's, and over the further course of the 18th Century, Giacomo Leoni, Matthew Brettingham and John Carr of York – the latter was responsible for the stable block and outbuildings. Wortley Hall is Listed Grade II*.

As you would expect for such a historic estate, Wortley Hall has a traditional walled kitchen garden, and this may date from the early-mid 18th century. **See attached photo of designed entrance to the walled kitchen garden.**

The OS map 25 inch:1mile 1892-1914 series shows a glasshouse range along the south facing elevation of the north wall of the kitchen garden with a central door between the ranges leading to a passage between bothies on the north side and out to the fringe of garden immediately south of The Avenue. There are also similar structures shown on the OS 6 inches:1mile map 1840's-1880's (County Series) but without the detail.

The walled kitchen garden lies to the west of the Hall on the west side of the stable block wall. The brick walls were heated, and parts of this system remain as do some of the sheds and bothies against the north face of the north wall. In 2000 when Wortley Hall was surveyed for the Register the sheds and bothies were disused. However, it appears that Chimney Cottage and the adjacent Mushroom Cottage have been converted from the historic bothies since that date. To the north of these cottages lies the public road, The Avenue, that accesses Wortley Hall itself.

We find the submitted documents rather confusing. The Site Plan appears to show Mushroom and Chimney Cottages transposed but that may be the incorrect labelling of the dwellings on the plan. In

addition, on the Existing Plans and Elevations the elevations have reversed north and south. The existing 'shed' and 'conservatory' are on the south elevation projecting into the walled garden itself.

The Design Access and Heritage Statement is limited in its information. There is no mention that the site is a designated Park and Garden (Grade II) with the walls of the kitchen garden also Listed Grade II 'by curtilage' as part of Wortley Hall. It writes of '...a single-storey terrace house lies within the row of traditional stone infill homes on the Avenue. The site faces the expansive Yorkshire countryside and sits in front of an allotment to the rear.'

This is inaccurate. Chimney Cottage is a converted historic bothy part of the historic walled kitchen garden and indeed the kitchen garden remains a working kitchen garden of significant heritage and cultural status. Wortley Walled Garden Growers (WWGG) which is a constituted voluntary group manages the kitchen garden.

The proposal is to develop the existing single storey three-bedroom dwelling converted from historic bothies into a four-bedroom dwelling that adds a master bedroom, dressing room and bathroom, a large open plan kitchen/dining/living room and office, projecting southwards into the walled kitchen garden itself. It appears that the proposal includes altering/removing some historic fabric of the kitchen garden wall in order to make new access arrangements into the rooms of the extension. The proposal essentially doubles the area of the cottage.

Although this proposed extension has been kept low down just below the historic kitchen garden wall we are concerned about the large amount of glazing and roof lights that will have reflection issues. In terms of Wortley Hall, Chimney Cottage appears to be concealed from the Hall by existing trees. A cross section from the road across the site into the walled garden would be useful.

There are no details about the materials to be used for the retaining wall. The Design Access and Heritage Statement writes 'It is also planned to dig out the rear garden to allow it all to be on one level, with a simple retaining wall constructed around the perimeter. This will give a courtyard-style garden to the property.' In our view this is contrary to the history and culture of a historic walled garden which has always been used for growing plants for food and aesthetic reasons. In addition, the proposed footprint of the extension with a courtyard and perimeter wall will be at odds with that of the historic glasshouse range shown on the early OS maps. There are additional concerns regarding the digging out – possible archaeology, ingress of groundwater and general access for the work.

Although views from The Avenue will be unchanged it is inaccurate to describe the proposal as having no impact on public views. The walled garden is open as a local attraction with volunteers working within the garden and there are increasing numbers of visitors – indeed a large group of YGT members visited a few years ago. The large expanse of windows will look out onto an area where gardeners will be working and visitors walking and enjoying their visit. The proposal will result in considerable impact on the views from the walled garden.

In general, we have concerns about access and there is no mention of damage to existing trees and structures of the walled garden.

Overall, we consider that this application will harm the significance of the designated heritage asset and in our view does not comply with NPPF paragraphs 197, 199, 200 and 202. The Gardens Trust and Yorkshire Gardens Trust object to this planning application.

Yours sincerely,
Val Hepworth
Trustee Conservation and Planning

cc. Historic England, e-yorks@historicengland.org.uk; Conservation@ the Gardens Trust

Attachment: Photo of designed entrance to the walled kitchen garden, Wortley Hall.