

## YORKSHIRE GARDENS TRUST

President: The Countess of Harewood Vice-presidents: Lady Legard, Peter Goodchild, Nick Lane Fox www.yorkshiregardenstrust.org.uk

Ms Rachael Roddis Planning Officer Barnsley Metropolitan Borough Council

Mrs Val Hepworth
Trustee
Conservation and Planning

conservation@yorkshiregardenstrust.org.uk

developmentmanagement@barnsley.gov.uk

3<sup>rd</sup> April 2024

Dear Ms Roddis

2024/0218 [LBC] Erection of single storey extension to rear of bungalow cottage, excavation works to rear to create new levelled out rear garden with paving surface and replacement retaining walls and fences around the perimeter (Listed Building Consent) in association with planning application 2023/0783. Chimney Cottage, The Avenue, Wortley, Sheffield, S35 7DB

Thank you for consulting The Gardens Trust (GT) in its role as Statutory Consultee with regard to proposed development affecting Wortley Hall, a site included by Historic England (HE) on their Register of Parks & Gardens, as per the above application, at grade II. The Yorkshire Gardens Trust (YGT) is a member organisation of the GT and works in partnership with it in respect of the protection and conservation of registered sites and is authorised by the GT to respond on GT's behalf in respect of such consultations.

Wortley Hall has been associated with the Wortley family since the time of King Stephen and significant architects and landscape designers have worked there from Ralph Tunnicliffe in the 1730's, and over the further course of the 18<sup>th</sup> Century, Giacomo Leoni, Matthew Brettingham and John Carr of York – the latter was responsible for the stable block and outbuildings. Wortley Hall is Listed Grade II\*. As you would expect for such a historic estate, Wortley Hall has a traditional walled kitchen garden, and this may date from the early-mid 18<sup>th</sup> century.

The walled kitchen garden lies to the west of the Hall on the west side of the stable block wall. The brick walls were heated, and parts of this system remain as do some of the sheds and bothies against the north face of the north wall. In 2000 when Wortley Hall was surveyed for the Register the sheds and bothies were disused. However, it appears that Chimney Cottage and the adjacent Mushroom Cottage have been converted from the historic bothies since that date. To the north of these cottages lies the public road, The Avenue, that accesses Wortley Hall itself.

As we explained in our letter of 17<sup>th</sup> October 2023 in response to the consultation for **2023/0783**, the kitchen garden remains a working kitchen garden of significant heritage and cultural status. It is not an allotment. Wortley Walled Garden Growers (WWGG) which is a constituted voluntary group manages the kitchen garden, with Chimney Cottage, a former bothy, situated on the north wall.

As with the 2023/0783 application we find the submitted documents remain confusing eg The Site Plan appears to show Mushroom and Chimney Cottages transposed; on the Plans and Elevations the elevations seem to have reversed north and south. There seems to be a discrepancy between

the diagram on p5 of the Design, Access and Heritage statement (which is unchanged from the original application) and the detailed drawings. Is the footprint smaller, are the roof lights removed and is the height reduced somewhat? If this is the case, and particularly the removal of roof lights, then this will be less damaging to the heritage assets.

Overall, in our view the submission is lacking in the detail and clarity that we consider necessary for a Listed Building Consent application.

For example, the Design Access and Heritage Statement is limited in its information. There is no mention that the site is a designated Park and Garden (Grade II) with the walls of the kitchen garden also Listed Grade II 'by curtilage' as part of Wortley Hall. It writes of '...a single-storey terrace house lies within the row of traditional stone infill homes on the Avenue. The site faces the expansive Yorkshire countryside and sits in front of an allotment to the rear.' It also writes 'It is also planned to dig out the rear garden to allow it all to be on one level, with a simple retaining wall constructed around the perimeter. This will give a courtyard-style garden to the property.' In our view this is contrary to the history and culture of a historic walled garden which has always been used for growing plants for food and aesthetic reasons. In addition, the proposed footprint of the extension with a courtyard and perimeter wall will be at odds with that of the historic glasshouse range shown on the early OS maps. There are additional concerns regarding the digging out – possible archaeology, ingress of groundwater and general access for the work.

We note that the retaining wall appears to be the same height as in **2023/0783**, however the fence upon it is taller and in the proposed visuals (not previously provided for comparison) is an espalier post and wire style boundary with hedges. Although this is high it is a more sympathetic solution for the boundary but there will need to be agreement regarding its management.

We are not sure that this application covers the details of access for the works, damage to existing trees and the structures of the walled garden, and we regret the proposed loss of the feature plum tree in the Chimney Cottage Garden.

Although this Listed Building Consent application appears to be more acceptable than application 2023/0783, the Gardens Trust and Yorkshire Gardens Trust still have some concerns. However, we defer to the advice of your Authority's Conservation Team regarding the final determination of the details and strongly suggest that Wortley Walled Garden Growers (WWGG) are asked for their advice.

Yours sincerely,

Val Hepworth
Trustee Conservation and Planning

cc. Historic England, e-yorks@historicengland.org.uk; Conservation@ the Gardens Trust